DEVELOPING A GENRE-BASED RUBRIC FOR PROCEDURE TEXT WRITING ASSESSMENT IN JUNIOR HIGH SCHOOL

A THESIS

by

MULYATI
F2201221016

MASTER STUDY PROGRAM OF ENGLISH LANGUAGE EDUCATION
TEACHER TRAINING AND EDUCATION FACULTY
TANJUNGPURA UNIVERSITY
PONTIANAK
2024


UNIVERSITAS TANJUNGPURA
PONTIANAK

DEVELOPING A GENRE-BASED RUBRIC FOR PROCEDURE TEXT WRITING ASSESSMENT IN JUNIOR HIGH SCHOOL

A THESIS

Presented to Tanjungpura University in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Education

by

MULYATI
F2201221016

MASTER STUDY PROGRAM OF ENGLISH LANGUAGE EDUCATION
TEACHER TRAINING AND EDUCATION FACULTY
TANJUNGPURA UNIVERSITY
PONTIANAK
2024

DEVELOPING A GENRE-BASED RUBRIC FOR PROCEDURE TEXT WRITING ASSESSMENT IN JUNIOR HIGH SCHOOL

Jurisdiction Responsibility:

MULYATI

F2201221016

Approved by:

Supervisor I	Supervisor II
Dr. Regina, M. Pd.	**Dr. Y. Gatot Sutapa Y., M. Pd.**
NIP 196008231987032002	**NIP 196507171992031003**

Legalized by:

Dean of Teacher Training and Education Faculty of Tanjungpura University

Dr. Ahmad Yani T., M. Pd.

NIP 196604011991021001

DEVELOPING A GENRE-BASED RUBRIC FOR PROCEDURE TEXT WRITING ASSESSMENT IN JUNIOR HIGH SCHOOL

Jurisdiction Responsibility

MULYATI
F2201221016

Approved by:

Supervisor I	Supervisor II
Dr. Regina, M. Pd.	**Dr. Y. Gatot Sutapa Y., M. Pd**
NIP. 196008231987032002	NIP. 196507171992031003

Examiner I	Examiner II
Prof. Eusabinus Bunau, S.Pd., M.Si., Ph.D.	**Dwi Riyanti, M.A., Ph.D.**
NIP.196812301998031001	NIP. 197908042005012005

Date of Pass: December 9th, 2024

STATEMENT OF AUTHORSHIP

Except where reference is made in the text of the thesis, this thesis contains no material published elsewhere or extracted in whole or in part from a thesis or any degree or diploma.

No other person's work has been used without due acknowledgement in the main text of the thesis.

This thesis has not been submitted for the award of any degree of diploma in any other tertiary institution.

All research procedures reported in this thesis were approved by research supervisors, and did not break any faculty or university research ethics.

Signed:



Mulyati

Date : December 14th, 2024

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

All praises belong to Allah SWT, the Most Merciful, the Lord of the World. With His blessing and guidance, the researcher has completed this thesis as part of the requirements for obtaining a Master's degree in the Master Study Program of English Language Education, Teacher Training and Education Faculty, Tanjungpura University.

Therefore, the researcher would like to express her deepest gratitude and appreciation to all who have supported her in this research paper. She expresses her gratitude to:

1. Dr. Regina, M.Pd., the first supervisor, and Dr. Yohanes Gatot Sutapa Y., M. Pd., the second supervisor, for the guidance, suggestions, support, and motivation during the research,
2. Prof. Eusabinus Bunau, S.Pd., M.Si., Ph.D., the first examiner, and Dwi Riyanti, M.A., Ph.D., the second examiner, who have provided valuable suggestions,
3. Dr. Yohanes Gatot Sutapa Y., M. Pd., the Chair of Masters Study Program of English Language Education of Tanjungpura University,
4. All lecturers and staff of the Master Program of English Language Education, Teacher Training and Education Faculty of Tanjungpura University, for all the guidance, support, and knowledge, and for being the best mentors during the researcher's study,

5. Dr. Ahmad Yani T., M. Pd., the Dean of Teacher Training and Education Faculty of Tanjungpura University,
6. Ira Kusumaningrum, M.Pd. (Politeknik Negeri Sambas) and Finny Anita, M.Pd. (Universitas PGRI Pontianak) for their valuable contribution and support in this research,
7. Fellow English teachers and students for their valuable participation and support in this research,
8. Principal and officemates at SMPN 1 Jawai Selatan for their support and understanding,
9. Her classmates in the Master Study Program of English Language Education in the Class of 2022, who have been good partners during her study,
10. Her beloved mother, husband, daughters, brothers and sisters, for their unconditional love, prayer, support and endurance,

Moreover, the writer also extends her gratitude to those who cannot be mentioned individually for their valuable support to the researcher in completing this research.

Finally, she appreciates those who read this thesis and gives feedback. This thesis can be an additional resource for better English teaching and learning.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Halaman
Cover Page i
Jurisdiction Responsibility v
STATEMENT OF AUTHORSHIP vi
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS vii
TABLE OF CONTENTS ix
ABSTRACT xiv
CHAPTER I INTRODUCTION 1
1.1. Background of the Study 1
1.2. Research Questions 7
1.3. Research Purposes 7
1.4. Research Significances 8
1.5. Terminology 9
CHAPTER II LITERATURE REVIEW 11
2.1. Teaching Writing in EFL Context 11
2.2. Writing Activities in Junior High School 14
2.3. Genre in EFL Writing 20
2.3.1. Genre as an Approach in English Language Teaching 20
2.3.2. Genre as a Type of Text 22
2.4. Procedure Text 23
2.5. Scoring Method for Writing 26
2.6. Rubric 32
2.7. Developing Rubric for EFL Writing Assessment 33
2.8. The Scale in EFL Writing Assessment 41
CHAPTER III RESEARCH METHODOLOGY 43
3.1. Type of Research 43
3.2. Procedure of the Research 43
3.2.1. Analyse 43
3.2.2. Design 44

3.2.3. Develop 47
3.2.4. Implementation....48
3.2.5. Evaluation 48
3.3. Object and Participant....49
3.4. Data Collection Procedures....50
3.4.1 Technique and Tools of Data Collecting 51
3.5. Data Analysis 52
CHAPTER IV RESEARCH FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION 54
4.1. Research Findings....54
4.1.1. Analysis....54
4.1.2. Design 56
4.1.3. Develop 57
4.1.4. Implementation....65
4.1.5. Evaluation 68
4.2. Discussion....79
CHAPTER V CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION 88
5.1. Conclusion....89
5.2. Suggestion 89
BIBLIOGRAPHY 92
APPENDIX 1 TEACHERS' NEED QUESTIONNAIRE....98
APPENDIX 2 SYLLABUS 102
APPENDIX 3 LESSON PLAN 103
APPENDIX 5 STUDENTS' WORKSHEET 103
APPENDIX 6 INSTRUMENT OF EXPERT JUDGMENT 108
Expert 1 (First Evaluation Result) 108
Expert 2 (First Evaluation Result) 111
APPENDIX . SAMPLE OF STUDENTS' WORK 126

LISTS OF TABLES

Table 2.1.	Example of Holistic Rubric.....	27
Table 2.2.	Primary Trait Scoring Method to Assess Guided Writing.....	29
Table 2.3.	Primary Trait Scoring Method to Assess Summary Writing.....	29
Table 2.4.	Primary Trait Scoring Method to Assess Continue Writing.....	29
Table 2.5.	ESL Composition Profile by Jacob et al. (1981).....	31
Table 2.6.	Analytic Rubric for Informational Speech-City; High Beginner Learners.....	34
Table 2.7.	Assessment Rubric for Problem-Solution Short Essay.....	35
Table 2.8.	Example of Score of Title in the Rubric.....	36
Table 2.9.	Description of Scoring Essay's Paragraphing.....	36
Table 2.10.	Description of Scoring Essay's Task Response.....	37
Table 3.1	Distribution of Need Analysis in Questionnaire.....	43
Table 3.2.	Interpretation of Expert Judgment Result.....	52
Table 4.1.	Result of Rubric Implementation by Teacher.....	65
Table 4.2.	Experts Judgment Result (First Assessment).....	68
Table 4.3.	Experts Judgment Result (Second Assessment).....	76

LISTS OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1.	Punctuation Practice by Using Schedule.....	15
Figure 2.2.	Example of Preparation Activity for Writing.....	16
Figure 2.3.	Example of Reading Activity before Writing.....	17
Figure 4.1.	Steps of Designing the Rubric	56
Figure 4.2.	Steps of Developing the Rubric.....	58
Figure 4.3.	Implementation	64

LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix 1	Questionnaire for Need Analysis	96
Appendix 2	Syllabus	100
Appendix 3	Result of Need Analysis	101
Appendix 4	First Evaluation Result	106
Appendix 5	Second Evaluation Result	112
Appendix 6	Implementation	117
Appendix 7	Sample of Students' work	124
Appendix 8	ESL Composition Profile	128
Appendix 9	Example of Description in a Rubric	131
Appendix 10	Genre-Based Rubric	133

Mulyati (2024):Developing A Genre-Based Rubric For Procedure Text Writing Assessment In Junior High School

Supervisor I **:Dr. Regina, M.Pd.**

Supervisor II **:Dr. Y. Gatot Sutapa Y., M.Pd.**

ABSTRACT

This research aims to develop an assessment tool for junior high school students' procedure text writing. The tool is a genre-based rubric. Based on the needs analysis, the results indicate that a genre-based rubric, especially for procedure texts, is essential as it facilitates a more effective assessment process for teachers and students. In its development process, the product is attached to the Merdeka Curriculum syllabus related to procedure text writing skills, lesson plans, instructions, student worksheets, and rubrics. This rubric was developed using the ADDIE model, which includes analysis, design, development, implementation, and evaluation. Based on the implementation results from teachers in the classroom and the evaluation results from experts, this rubric is suitable and appropriate for assessing procedure text writing in junior high school. The second assessment result from the experts shows a score of 100%, which can be interpreted as excellent. This finding indicates that the developed rubric can be applied to assess student procedure text.

Keywords: assessment, genre, procedure text, rubric, writing

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

1.1. Background of the Study

An accurate, dependable, and effective scale is essential in writing assessments. Appropriate scales can save costs and save time while also boosting rater reliability. However, many teachers need help assessing writing due to its complexity. To identify current problems, the researcher conducted a preliminary study by interviewing some junior high school English teachers. The initial study discovered several facts about teaching writing and writing assessment practice. Several writing activities are usually delivered by the teachers in the classroom in junior high school. For example, guided text writing about personal identity and description of something, writing a text about making or doing something and writing a text about daily activity. The student's worksheets and textbooks usually include activities such as completing personal identity and library cards, completing sentences in the text by filling in the blanks, rearranging jumbled words into sentences, writing sentences from two or three words provided following specific pattern/table, and writing phrases/sentences/paragraphs/texts by using picture prompts. Most activities are usually guided writing.

The initial study also discovered that apart from the student's difficulty in writing due to its complexity, the teacher also experiences difficulty teaching and assessing writing. Some teachers consider writing quite

challenging to measure as it involves complicated skills: vocabulary, mechanics, structure, topic, and language use.

Reading each piece of writing takes a lot of effort and time. In addition, assessing writing becomes even more challenging since the students have low English proficiency due to limited exposure and background knowledge of English, as mentioned earlier. However, it is still necessary to assess students' abilities, especially in areas where their performance might need to be improved (Ikhsanudin, 2020). Therefore, to make the assessment easier and faster, teachers apply a holistic scoring (Kim & Kessler, 2022). Thus, it is hard to see what aspect of writing the students are struggling.

Moreover, it is also discovered in the initial study that some teachers consider grading writing using a general writing rubric that commonly measures vocabulary, mechanics, structure, topic, and language use as irrelevant to apply to low-proficiency students. As they have limited background knowledge of grammar, it is challenging to rate students writing when focusing on grammar and language use.

In the era of AI, researchers have explored the use of an appropriate AI tool for automatic scoring model to assess students writing effectively (Zhao et al., 2023). The study uses AI scoring model that blends cross-modal matching technology with natural language processing (NLP) techniques to investigate the advantages of AI in automatically grading picture-cued writing assignments. The results show that an AI scoring model offers reliable and consistent scoring, which reduces subjectivity and grading time while

enabling up teachers to work on other responsibilities like planning lessons and student progress monitoring. However, writing is a creative process. Therefore, students' responses can vary greatly, which AI may not fully accommodate. although AI increases effectiveness, it may not fully capture the creativity and variety of student answers. AI-automated scoring minimizes subjectivity and increases efficiency. In contrast, manual grading allows teachers to recognize student' creativity and effort in writing. Therefore, it is clear that manual grading such as the use of traditional rating rubric remains important to ensure a comprehensive assessment of student writing.

There are several types of genre texts in English. Each has a different structure. Thus, the assessment should also pay attention to the structure of each genre, which is still scarcely observed. The general writing rubric is not developed based on a specific genre. Therefore, it does not include the genre aspect. In the early stages of EFL learning, assessing the text using a general rubric may not benefit students, especially when they make little progress in comprehending genre-based writing.

The other problem revealed is that the students often can not complete their writing assignments due to insufficient writing knowledge and time restrictions in the classroom. Some difficulties experienced by EFL learners in writing are in organization and language aspects such as vocabulary (Alisha et al., 2019; Daulay et al., 2023; Divani et al., 2018; Kristiana et al., 2021; Siregar, 2022), emotional constraints such as anxiety (Kristiana et al.,

2021), and grammar rules (Siregar, 2022 and Daulay et al., 2023). For many junior high school students in rural areas of Sambas Regency, writing can be more challenging as they have limited background knowledge and less exposure to English. Therefore, students struggle in writing. When writing is administered in EFL settings, where students are rarely exposed to English or the English writing requirements, the difficulty level advances noticeably (Chaisiri, 2010).

As learners struggle with writing difficulties, English teachers need to adapt the assessment rubric for assessing writing of novice English learners to ensure that it measures students' abilities objectively based on the student's level and allow teachers to recognize progress when the students progress in students'comprehension of genre-based writing.

Many researchers have investigated the validity and reliability of assessment rubrics for writing (Harmey et al., 2019; Hodges et al., 2019; Jacob & Clahsen, 2018; Keller et al., 2023; Li, 2022; Nakkaew & Adunyarittigun, 2019; Shabani & Panahi, 2020; Uludag & McDonough, 2022; Viñas, 2022), fairness among raters (Chamorro, 2020; Chan, 2014; Fujita & Tamura, 2012), and various techniques for teaching writing (Alharthi, 2021; Salmani-Nodoushan, 2020; Sari et al., 2023).

In other studies, some researchers have developed various rubrics for assessing writing skills. For example, in a recent study, Wright et al. (2023) developed and evaluated a rubric for scientific writing (RSW). The samples are from middle and high school classes. The samples are from middle and

high school classes. Meanwhile, in another study, the researcher focused on designing and developing an assessment rubric for composing emails in English as a foreign language (Keller et al., 2023). The rubric was implemented on the 8th and 9th grade students in Switzerland.

Another study about developing scoring rubric was also conducted by Rayana et al. (2019). This project aimed to develop a writing assessment rubric of explanatory text for grade XI students at SMK Negeri 4 Medan. In another study, Saputra and Marfuah (2022) developed an authentic writing assessment based on Kurikulum 2013. The study involved the tenth-grade students of SMAN Unggul Dharmasraya.

The previous studies explained above focused on developing rubric for writing assessment on scientific writing, explanatory text, emails, and authentic writing. Additionally, some of these studies were conducted in senior high schools and vocational schools. Therefore, this study is needed as it focused on developing rubric for assessing procedure text writing rubric especially in junior high school. This research is also necessary because, so far, writing assessments have always focused on content, organization, mechanics, grammar, and vocabulary. Meanwhile, junior high school students are beginners and do not have sufficient skills and knowledge in writing. If teachers continue to assess by applying all aspects, most students will fail to achieve good grades. Apart from that, in genre text writing assignments, the generic structure aspect is often ignored. In fact, according to experts, teaching generic structure is essential so that students can write genre texts

well. Therefore, generic structure elements also need to be considered in the assessment. However, few studies have focused on preparing rubrics, especially for procedure text genre texts. Therefore, the researcher attempts to cover the gap in the current study by constructing an assessment rubric focusing on specific genres of text writing, particularly procedure text. This study tries to cover the population gap where, in the previous studies, the developed rubric is designed for senior high school students. Meanwhile, in this study, the rubric is designed for assessing writing in junior high school. Moreover, this study also provides the alternative for English teacher for grading writing easier, especially for those who teach writing to low proficiency students. The results of this research can become an optional assessment tool that will ease teachers to assess student's written procedure text.

Based on the Alur Tujuan Pembelajaran (learning objectives) for English subjects in the Merdeka curriculum, junior high school students, especially grade 7, are expected to be able to: a) use English to produce spoken, descriptive, written, and visual text; b) use English for producing spoken, written, and visual procedure text; c) use English in familiar contexts, both in formal and informal situations. Specifically, students are expected to: a) describe a favourite food; b) request and provide information about food; c) identify equipment and ingredients in a recipe; d) explain the steps of cooking; e) use English to produce spoken, written, and visual text about favourite food.

Based on the curriculum above, in this study, the researcher focused on developing rubric for measuring procedure text which focusing on making a particular food.

The researcher developed analytical assessment rubric in the present study for writing by adapting the English Composition Profile (Jacob in Fajrina et al., 2021) and making it simpler. The analytic evaluation rubric provides an objective assessment for intensive/controlled short essay writing tasks (Brown cited in Widiastuti & Indriani, 2023) provides an objective assessment. The product of this study is a rubric for assessing procedure texts which can be used for junior high school.

1.2. Research Questions

Based on the background, the research questions are:

1. What is the junior high school teachers' needs in assessing writing of procedure text?
2. How is the development of the genre-based rubric for procedure text writing in junior high school?
3. How is the applicability of the genre-based rubric for procedure text writing in junior high school?

1.3. Research Purposes

Based on the stated problem above, the aims of this study are as the followings.

1. To describe the junior high school teachers' needs in assessing writing of procedure text.

2. To develop a set of genre-based rubric for assessing procedure text writing in junior high school
3. To find out the applicability of the genre-based rubric set for assessing procedure text writing in junior high school**.**

1.4. Research Significances

This research is designed to provide positive contribution to English language teaching especially in the area of writing assessment in junior high school. This study is important for several reasons.

a. For teacher
   1. This study provides an example of assessment tool for genre-based writing which can be used.
   2. Teachers can also use the product of this study .

b. For students
   1. This study can enhance students' understanding of genre text, particularly procedure text. (the lexicogrammatical features, the text's structure, and the text's purpose).
   2. Knowing the aspects being measured helps reducing learning anxiety.

c. For institutions or schools

   This study provides a comprehensive assessment tool for supporting ELT syllabi, ensuring writing assessments' quality.

d. For other researchers

1. Other researchers may improve the rubric produced in this study to enrich writing assessment and rubric development in ELT.
2. This study can be an additional reference for those who are interested in doing development research particularly in the area of writing assessment.
3. Other researchers can conduct further study in applying the rubric in different setting of place with different background of students.

1.5. Terminology

1. Genre refers to the conventions and characteristics of a specific text genre with its particular features. Genre in this study is defined as type of text which has specific social function and text structure. Different genre represents different communicative purpose. Genre in this study includes procedure text, taught in junior high school as included in the mandated contents of the current curriculum.
2. Writing refers to the skill of composing procedures texts. The type of writing for junior high school students is typically guided writing.
3. Assessment refers to the process of evaluating and measuring students' abilities to produce written texts based on specific criteria. Assessment in this study determines how well a student has mastered the writing skills required in a procedure text, following the generic structure of the text, such as the correct use of language, mechanic, and sequence of steps. In this study, assessment specifically measures the students'

ability to write a procedure text, focusing on various aspects such as organization, language features (imperatives, logical sequence), vocabulary, grammar, and the clarity of instructions.

4. A rubric typically outlines the expectations for different levels of achievement and provides a standardized grading method. In the context of this study, the term rubric refers to a scoring guide specifically designed to evaluate students' written procedure texts. This rubric is designed around genre-specific criteria, ensuring that the features of the procedure text genre are assessed systematically.
5. Junior high school refers to secondary education that includes grades seven through nine, bridging the gap between elementary school and senior high school. Junior high school students in Indonesia are typically aged 12 to 15.